TARGETED HARASSMENT OF FACULTY

APRIL 28, 2022
Part I: Manufactured Outrage

Isaac Kamola
Trinity College

ikamola@trincoll.edu
Dear Administrators: To Protect Your Faculty from Right-Wing Attacks, Follow the Money
Isaac Kamola

Sensationalized Surveillance: Campus Reform and the Targeted Harassment of Faculty
Samantha McCarthy* and Isaac Kamola*

*School of Social Work, Policy, and Practice, University of Chicago, Chicago, USA;  Political Science, Trinity College, Hartford, USA
Structure of Social Change

Universities
“Intellectual Raw Materials”

Think Tanks
“Second-hand dealers of ideas”

INSTITUTE FOR HUMANE STUDIES
AT GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

MERCATUS CENTER
George Mason University
CELEBRATING 40 YEARS AT MASON

State Policy Network

CATHOLIC ACADEMIC PROJECTS

The Center for Growth and Opportunity
at Utah State University

Center for the Philosophy of Freedom

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

Goldwater Institute

Leadership Institute

MACKINAC CENTER
FOR PUBLIC POLICY

The Heritage Foundation
LEADERSHIP FOR AMERICA

Model Legislation

Advocacy

INSTITUTE FOR HUMANE STUDIES
AT GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

MERCATUS CENTER
George Mason University
CELEBRATING 40 YEARS AT MASON

State Policy Network

CATHOLIC ACADEMIC PROJECTS

The Center for Growth and Opportunity
at Utah State University

Center for the Philosophy of Freedom

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

Goldwater Institute

Leadership Institute

MACKINAC CENTER
FOR PUBLIC POLICY

The Heritage Foundation
LEADERSHIP FOR AMERICA

Model Legislation

Advocacy
Structure of Social Change  (part 2)

Implementation Groups

Model Legislation

Advocacy

Demographic/Issue Specific Mobilization:
- Generation Opportunity (youth voters)
- Libre Initiative (Latinx voters)
- 60 Plus Association (Social Security privatization)
- American Energy Alliance (cap and trade opposition)
- Center to Protect Patient Rights (health care privatization)
- Aegis Strategic i360 (data analytics).

Tea Party

Political Pressure

Desired Policy Outcome

- “Right-to-work”
- Tax cuts
- Undermine Environmental and Financial regulation
- Voter ID laws
- Cut social spending
- Conceal carry
- Privatize the VA
- Undermine ACA
- Deregulate campaign finance
- Anti-lockdown
- CRT bills (privatize K-12)
Leadership Institute

• $23 million annual budget (2020)
• Founded in 1979 by Morten Blackwell; also founded Council for National Policy
• Trains college students to be conservative activists and journalists.

Funding (through 2019):
• Koch Foundation ($228,358+)
• DonorsTrust/Donor Capital Fund ($1,339,788+)
• Kirby Foundation ($1.2 million+)
• Uihlein Foundation ($1.165 million)
• Bradley Foundation ($950,000+)

“Political technology can be roughly divided into communication technology and organization technology, with no neat line of separation between communication and organization.”

—Morton Blackwell (quote in: Nelson, Shadow Network)

“State Policy Network (affiliate or funder)
“Campus Reform Correspondent Compensation Program”:

**Tipster:** $50 per approve tip

**Bronze** (1-4 stories): $50 per article; website profile; business cards; online training

**Silver** (5-14 stories): $75 per article; resume prep; weekly mentoring groups call; press pass; “Priority over Level 1 story pitches”

**Gold** (15+ stories): $100 articles; personal mentorship; 2-day all expense paid training; official email address, promo reel, etc.

ARTICLE 1

**DUTIES OF A CAMPUS CORRESPONDENT**

1.1 **Services Provided.** Campus Reform Campus Correspondent agrees to help produce content for Campus Reform through exposing and reporting on incidents of liberal bias and abuse occurring on U.S. college campuses. The Campus Correspondent’s work may include, but is not limited to: reporting news tips to Campus Reform, writing stories for publication on site, obtaining audio, video, and other forms of documentation for Campus Reform. Upon acceptance of an article by Campus Reform, the Correspondent will be paid for the article according to the compensation program outlined above.
In March 2018, Fox News ran 53 segments about controversies on college campuses. 40 were previously reported by Campus Reform. 15 cited Campus Reform or included a Campus Reform correspondent.**

*Benkler, Faris, and Roberts, Network Propaganda: Manipulation, Disinformation, and Radicalization in American Politics (Oxford University Press, 2018)

Welcome to Faculty First Responders

In recent years, many faculty have experienced targeted harassment for statements they have made in their classroom, research, or social media. Much of this harassment originates with articles published by a handful of media platforms or right-wing political organizations and can result in a deluge of hateful messages and threats. These attacks can be scary, isolating, and traumatic. Administrations often respond badly to these attacks. At worst, they have even resulted in academic institutions firing faculty members.
Survey Overview

• We logged **1575** total Campus Reform stories in 2020
• **247** stories accused faculty of liberal bias (**338** total individuals)
• **213 survey responses** (63%)
Location of Speech?
• 78% public forum (social media, opinion piece, public presentation/lecture, protest, etc.)
• 9% classroom speech (online teaching and student email correspondence)
• 8% research

Picked up by other venues? Yes: 65.3%

Threats of Harm? Yes: 40%
• 89% received email, 57% direct message, 45% received phone calls, 11% physical mail.

• An additional 10.7 percent report unwanted unwanted, hateful, or harassing emails, direct messages, or mail (but did not classify these as threatening)

Support from administrators
• 45.3% of faculty reported receiving support from their administration (much of it in private)

• 12.4% received some sort of sanctions.
PART II: WE ARE NOT PREPARED FOR THIS

But we can be!

Jennifer Lundquist
University of Massachusetts Amherst.
“UMass Amherst’s mission is rooted in the land-grant purpose of research, education, and service to society. Engagement is one method by which we fulfill our mission to create positive impact on the Commonwealth and the broader society we serve.”

- UMass Amherst Website

“Scholarly Engagement is the creation, integration, application and transmission of knowledge for the benefit of external audiences and the University and occurs in all areas of the University Mission: research, teaching and service.”

- UMass Faculty Senate

“Provide tools and training opportunities for all faculty and staff to become adept at working in a diverse and inclusive environment, whether inside or outside the classroom, with colleagues, and with the general public.”

–UMass Strategic Plan
“Public scholarship means pissing people off.”

- Tressie MacMillan Cottom

“If you want the reputational currency of public scholars, you’d better have institutional processes & courage to go with it.”
"Thus far Mr. Hearst has concentrated his fury at Syracuse and Columbia Universities where he assigned agents to spy on professors suspected of “radical tendencies.”
Funded by Right-Wing Mega Donors

Amplified by the Right-Wing Media Eco-System

Exacerbated by Abusive Online Vigilantism
Cyberbullying that can include posting rumors, threats, sexual remarks, violent comments, or hate speech (usually anonymous)

Trolling

Broadcasting private, identifying, and/or locational information about an individual for the purpose of harassment

Doxxing

Harassing content that appears to arise organically at the grassroots level and spread, but is coordinated (often using multiple fake accounts) by an individual, interest group, political party, or organization

Astro-turfing
Be PREPARED

1. Form committee with key people
   - University Relations
   - Union
   - Faculty
   - Admin
   - Public Records
   - IT
   - Security

2. Create toolkit with point people at each step
   You are welcome to borrow from ours:
   https://www.umass.edu/sbs/faculty/professional-
   resources/faculty-resources

3. Circulate to:
   - Dept., Chairs, Faculty Senate, Communications, Security, Deans
     meetings, etc.

4. Regular workshops for Chairs
Responding to Harassment of UMass Faculty for their Research, Teaching, and Public Engagement (SBS Resources)

The University of Massachusetts Amherst upholds and defends the scholarly expertise that faculty bring to their research and to their classroom. The recognition and defense of academic freedom is more important now than ever before.

Deepening political polarization and the role of social media in quickly spreading disinformation and inflammatory rhetoric has led to increased incidence of public harassment and defamation of faculty for their research, scholarly public engagement and positions taken in the classroom.

Are you being targeted?
Review these resources (UMass login required).

Are you the Chair of a faculty member who is being attacked?
Click here for guidance (UMass login required).
Be PREPARED

1. Assess security threats
2. Get full details from victim
Description of Harassment Form

For use in cases where faculty or staff experience online, media, and/or public harassment for their research or other work at the University of Massachusetts Amherst.

Please be thorough. This is to prevent you from repeating the story to multiple people. Please also send any additional supporting materials.

This documentation will not be circulated outside of UMass administration. If there are concerns about confidentiality, fill out only those areas below you feel comfortable filling out and provide your chair or a trusted colleague with any additional detail.

Name of Faculty or Staff: ____________________________ Date: ____________________________

Email Address of Faculty or Staff: ____________________________

What is your role?

- I am the target of harassment.
- The target of harassment reported the incident(s) to me.
Other: ______________ 

Describe the harassment. When did it begin? How has it evolved?

What are the contexts of harassment (check all that apply)?

- Social media
- Email
- Via media requests
- Via FOIA requests
- Media coverage
- In the classroom
- In the office
- At home
- Voice messages
- Campus stalking
- Harassment of family members
- Other: ______________
Description of Harassment

Is the harassment coming from known individuals or entities? If so, provide that information.

To whom, if anyone, have you reported this?

To your knowledge, what action(s) have been taken at this point?

What are your most pressing concerns?

If you wish to, please include any additional details or evidence below.
Communicate Quickly

1. Contact Press/PR point person
2. Alert Dean
3. Inform and prepare staff, departmental colleagues
4. Develop response to external inquiries
“The university had no comment”

Is this the message you want to send?

Develop go-to messaging that asserts the institution’s commitment to academic freedom
UMass Standardized Response
(can then be tweaked to context)

“Faculty members at the University of Massachusetts Amherst share their expertise on a broad spectrum of disciplines that enrich the educational experience of students, who benefit from discussion and debate of divergent views and are encouraged to develop their own ideas and beliefs.

Professor X is an established and respected scholar in their discipline and a valued member of our university. As with all our scholars at the University of Massachusetts, Professor X has the right of academic freedom necessary to pursue scholarship, research and teaching on important subjects.

Healthy debate and disagreement is a celebrated cornerstone of academic freedom. Bullying and harassment of faculty members who exercise their academic freedom, however, is not, and we condemn it in the strongest of terms.”
Get more specific if necessary, but this requires more time and coordination

“The search for truth is the animating force of a university, and it behooves those who support open and respectful discussion of controversial issues to get the facts right. Recently the views expressed by a member of our community, Professor Lawrence Torcello, have been misrepresented by some in the media. The misrepresentation follows a pattern similar to other incidents of misrepresentation involving academics that work on topics related to climate change. We encourage people to carefully read Professor Torcello’s article itself rather than rely on distortions of its contents circulating on the web.”

- Rochester Institute for Technology
“Thank you for your interest in this issue. Calls on this topic are being handled by our News and Media Relations Office. Would you like me to transfer you to that office?”
Unsubstantiated Accusations

“Your recent emails to ______ at UMass Amherst have been brought to my attention. I am writing to you as the university’s campus spokesperson. Based on our experience at UMass Amherst, the supposed statements attributed to ______ is out of character and inconsistent with their record at the university. They say no such correspondence occurred. No evidence has been provided to substantiate your claims. Absent evidence to the contrary, the university does not engage in commenting, beyond this statement, on unsubstantiated allegations.”
Recently, one of our professors shared thoughts on 9/11 on social media. These comments have been the subject of much scrutiny and vehement disagreement by critics. That is their right, just as our professor has the right to free speech, however uncomfortable it may make anyone feel. What cannot be tolerated are the harassment and violent threats that we have seen in response that have been directed at this professor. Our Department of Public Safety is in contact with the professor and has engaged the support of federal, state and local law enforcement agencies.

Some have asked the University to condemn the professor’s comments and others have demanded the professor’s dismissal. Neither of those actions will happen. As the home of the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, free speech for all people across the political spectrum, within the limits of the law and the University’s anti-harassment policy, is one of our key values. Speech can be offensive, hurtful or provocative. Still, Syracuse University will stand by the principles of free speech and by our commitment to keeping our community safe in the face of threats and harassment.

- Syracuse Chancellor and Dean
Protective Support System

1. Connect faculty to union liaison, to peer social support, and counseling services on campus

2. Collect and monitor the harassment
   - Forward harassing emails as attachments to IT point person

3. Block and report on social media and email platforms

4. Remove contact info from dept. webpage and university directory
Research the policies that apply to your university

• In the US, the policy varies by state and applies to all public universities

• Applies to any communication: emails, texts, research documents, telephone records, etc.

• Redact personal (and FERPA) information before sharing

Prevention: Educate faculty about record retention and email usage
Educate on Protections

**Academic Freedom**
- Protects from censorship, institutional discipline and termination (at a public university)
- Include AAUP statements on academic freedom and external utterances

**State Law on Harassment**
- In MA, threatening, stalking and harassing behavior, including over electronic communication and social media, is a felony

**At UMass, when working within the scope of their duties of teaching, research and service:**
- Faculty receive legal indemnification if sued
- Faculty are entitled to free consultation from Union and University General Counsel
  - However, they must find their own attorney to pursue a civil case (e.g. defamation)
AAUP

“Teachers are entitled to full freedom in research and in the publication of the results, subject to the adequate performance of their other academic duties... Teachers are entitled to freedom in the classroom in discussing their subject, but they should be careful not to introduce into their teaching controversial matter which has no relation to their subject.”

External Utterances

“Professors should also have the freedom to address the larger community with regard to any matter of social, political, economic, or other interest, without institutional discipline or restraint, save in response to fundamental violations of professional ethics or statements that suggest disciplinary incompetence.” .... “When they speak or write as citizens, they should be free from institutional censorship or discipline, but their special position in the community imposes special obligations. As scholars and educational officers, they should remember that the public may judge their profession and their institution by their utterances. Hence they should at all times be accurate, should exercise appropriate restraint, should show respect for the opinions of others, and should make every effort to indicate that they are not speaking for the institution.”
U.S. Classroom Protections

• Lectures and course materials are protected by U.S. copyright laws (and in many cases also by university policy)

• Students may not record lectures nor circulate course materials without instructor’s consent

• Violations are subject to copyright takedown notice and University disciplinary action
“My lectures and course materials, including PowerPoint presentations, videos, assignments, tests, outlines and similar materials, and all course recordings, are protected by U.S. copyright laws and by university policy. I am the exclusive owner of the copyright in materials I create.

You may take notes and make copies of course materials for your own use in this class. You may also share those materials with another student who is registered and enrolled in this course. You may not reproduce, distribute, upload, or display any lecture notes or recordings or course materials in any other way—whether or not a fee is charged—without my express written consent. If you do so, you may be subject to disciplinary action under the UMass Code of Student Conduct.

Similarly, you own the copyright to your original papers and exam essays. If I am interested in posting your answers or papers on the course web site, I will ask for your written permission.”

--UMass Union suggested syllabus statement
Be Proactive. Create Resources that …


♦ Help faculty and administration anticipate risks
♦ Educate faculty on their academic freedom, legal and copyright protections
♦ Inform faculty on best practices for record retention and email usage
♦ **Distribute the teaching of sensitive topics across all faculty**
♦ Develop your university’s response template

♦ Update policies
  ~ Restatement of Academic Freedom updated for the media age
  ~ Updated student and employee code of conduct
  • E.g. Cornell’s statement in 2017 and overhaul of campus values and conduct policies in 2021

Respond

♦ Provide immediate support and reassurance
  (Faculty will also be concerned about what it means for tenure and promotion)
♦ Provide a list of action steps and point people along the way